

**THE SEVENTH MEETING OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE
OF THE CITY OF GREATER SUDBURY**

**Council Chamber
Tom Davies Square**

**Monday, March 22, 2004
Commencement: 5:30 p.m.**

Chair

COUNCILLOR TED CALLAGHAN, IN THE CHAIR

Present

Councillors Berthiaume; Bradley; Caldarelli; Craig; Dupuis; Gainer; Gasparini; Kett; Reynolds; Rivest; Thompson; Mayor Courtemanche (D 9:50 p.m.)

City Officials

M. Mieto, Chief Administrative Officer; D. Belisle, General Manager of Public Works; C. Hallsworth, General Manager of Citizen & Leisure Services; B. Lautenbach, Acting General Manager of Economic Development & Planning Services; C. Matheson, General Manager of Health & Social Services; D. Wuksinic, General Manager, Corporate Services; T. Beadman, Acting General Manager, Emergency Services; H. Salter, Acting Director of Legal Services/City Solicitor; S. Jonasson, Director of Finance/City Treasurer; C. Mahaffy, Manager of Financial Planning and Policy; E. Stankiewicz, Co-Ordinator of Current Budget; P. Wilson, Co-ordinator of Administrative Services; J.P. Graham, Plants Engineer; C. Ouellette, Director of Children's Services; R. Carré, Director of Leisure, Community & Volunteer Services; G. Clausen, Director of Engineering Services; D. Della Vedova, Community Development Officer; T. Durbacz, Manager of Events, Aquatics & Ski Hills; R. Ahola, Manager of Municipal Arenas & Community Centres; C. Gore, Manager of Volunteerism & Community Development; D. Yachuk, Community Development Officer; D. Stefankow, Instrumentperson; T. Mowry, City Clerk; M. Burtch, Licensing & Assessment Clerk; CJ Caporale, Council Secretary

CUPE Local 4705

W. MacKinnon, President

News Media

Sudbury Star; Channel 10 News; MCTV; EZ Rock

Declarations of
Pecuniary Interest

None

CORRESPONDENCE - INFORMATION ONLY

Item 2
Notice of Adoption of
the 2004 Budget

Report dated 2004-03-19 from the General Manager of Corporate Services regarding Notice of Adoption of the 2004 Budget was received for information only.

- Item 3
Current Budget - 2004
Public Input Session 2
Update
- Report dated 2004-03-10 from the General Manager of Corporate Services regarding Current Budget - 2004 Public Input Session 2 Update was received for information only.
- Item 4
Tax Relief to Low
Income Earners and
Seniors
- Report dated 2004-03-10 from the General Manager of Corporate Services regarding Tax Relief to Low Income Earners and Seniors was received for information only.
- Councillor Gasparini requested that all four options listed on Page 9 and 10 of the agenda be considered as proposed enhancement options. By a show of hands, the Committee concurred.
- Councillor Craig asked the General Manager of Corporate Services if the tax relief was for property owners exclusively and stated that seniors who reside in apartments, and were long-time taxpayers, should be treated fairly. Mr. Wuksinic advised the Committee that the taxation relief is to be provided to low income property owners only and was not aware of ways to address those who are not property owners. With the consensus of the Committee, the Chair suggested that staff look into a possible tax relief for low income apartment dwellers.
- Item 5
City of Greater
Sudbury Debt Position
- Report dated 2004-03-19 from the General Manager of Corporate Services regarding City of Greater Sudbury Debt Position at December 31, 2003 was received for information only.
- Item 6
2004 S.D.H.U. Budget
West Nile
Contingencies
- Report dated 2004-03-19 from the General Manager of Corporate Services regarding 2004 Sudbury & District Health Unit Budget West Nile Contingencies was received for information only.
- The General Manager of Corporate Services advised the Committee that a letter was received from the Sudbury & District Health Unit that afternoon and suggested that it be dealt with at the next Finance Committee meeting of 2004-03-24.
- With the consensus of the Committee, the Chair advised that they would deal with the letter from the Health Unit on the Finance Agenda dated 2004-03-24, after the presentation from the Greater Sudbury Police Services.
- Item 7
Materials & Operating
Expenses
- Report dated 2004-03-19 from the General Manager of Corporate Services regarding Materials and Operating Expenses was received for information only.

Item 8
Comparison of
Pre-Amalgamation
Staffing & Current
Levels of Staffing

Report dated 2004-03-19 from the General Manager of Corporate Services regarding Comparison of Pre-amalgamation Staffing and Current Levels of Staffing was received for information only.

Councillor Gasparini asked the General Manager of Corporate Services for a breakdown of the reduction in the number of employees (164) at the time of amalgamation into union and non-union positions. The Chair, with the consensus of the Committee, advised that the Chief Administrative Officer would provide the above information.

Organizational Chart
with Reporting
Relationships

Councillor Berthiaume requested that staff provide Council with a City of Greater Sudbury Organizational Chart that indicates reporting relationships. He also indicated that this chart should show those who will be retiring in the near future. Mr. Mieto advised the Committee that staff is currently working on an attrition report which will indicate the employees who are expected to retire and those who are working longer than anticipated.

With a show of hands, the Committee concurred that staff provide an Organizational Chart with reporting relationships.

Employees' Seniority
Listing

Councillor Dupuis asked the Chief Administrative Officer if there was a seniority listing available broken down in five year increments. Mr. Mieto advised the Committee that this could be provided.

With the consensus of the Committee, the Chair asked staff to provide the employees' seniority listing and to list it in five year increments.

Item 9
Human Resources
Division Legal Costs
Review

Report dated 2004-03-12 from the General Manager of Corporate Services regarding Human Resources Division Legal Costs Review was received for information only.

Item 10
Convergence of
Utilities

Report dated 2004-03-08 from the General Manager of Public Works regarding Convergence of Utilities was received for information only.

Item 11
Sewer & Water
Servicing

Report dated 2004-03-09, with attachments, from the General Manager of Public Works regarding Sewer & Water Servicing was received for information only.

Councillor Rivest asked the General Manager of Public Works if the home owners on the list have been canvassed recently. Mr. Belisle advised the Committee that the list was developed a decade ago. Councillor Thompson suggested that the homeowners be canvassed again to determine whether or not sewer and water services are still a priority.

Recess

At 6:45 p.m., the Finance Committee recessed.

Reconvene

At 7:00 p.m., the Finance Committee reconvened.

Item 11
Sewer & Water
Servicing
(continued)

Mr. Belisle advised the Committee that the only variable for a revised priority list would be the desires of the public and the comments from the Sudbury & District Health Unit. He indicated that the economic impact hasn't changed and that the cost can be done in-house.

With the consensus of the Committee, the Chair indicated that staff submit an update on the water/wastewater priority list, without canvassing the public, in June 2004.

Item 12
Budget Enhancements
Snow Clearing for
Churches &
Community Service
Groups

Report dated 2004-03-15, with attachments, from the General Manager of Public Works regarding Budget Enhancements - Snow Clearing for Churches & Community Service Groups was received for information only.

Councillor Bradley asked the General Manager of Public Works what the savings were if this was discontinued. Mr. Belisle advised the Committee that the cost was never indicated in the budget or documented, but that there would be a reduction of cost. Councillor Berthiaume indicated that this should be added as a cost reduction in the Budget.

Councillor Dupuis asked the General Manager of Public Works if a compromise could be reached regarding the clearing of snow on City property for funeral and wedding services at the Churches. Mr. Belisle advised the Committee that the City will clear snow banks for funeral and wedding services only if the Church provides notice in advance.

Budget Reduction
Option

With the consensus of the Committee, the Chair indicated that a budget option be added to eliminate snow clearing at Church and Community Service Group parking lots.

MOTIONS

Item 13
Recreational Facilities

Presented by Councillor Gasparini:

Gasparini-Berthiaume: WHEREAS many residents in the City of Greater Sudbury both throughout the election and during the budget consultation process have requested that Council consider the re-opening of recreational facilities that were closed in 2003;

AND WHEREAS these facilities contribute significantly to the overall quality of life in Greater Sudbury;

Item 13
Recreational Facilities
(continued)

AND WHEREAS opportunities for active, physical recreation are essential to our overall health and well being given that we are facing a crisis of increased obesity amongst our population and have poor indicators of cardiac health;

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT the Council of the City of Greater Sudbury direct staff to prepare a report outlining options with alternative management and development models for the Adanac Ski Hill, the Falconbridge Arena and the Dow Pool which will engage the community and involve interested citizens, including, for example, the possible creation of a not for profit corporation or the creation of a citizen management Board which could be mandated to market the facilities, increase utilization and fund raise in support of the facilities;

AND FURTHER THAT \$650,000 be committed to a reserve fund for capital expenditures for those facilities (\$500,000 - chair lift at Adanac Ski Hill; \$90,000 - Dow Pool; \$60,000 - Falconbridge Arena) through a reallocation of existing reserve funds, and that these funds remain in reserve until such time as this Council directs, following consideration of the above mentioned report and the approval of business plans and operating budgets for each facility.

Friendly Amendment

With the concurrence of the mover, Councillor Reynolds asked that the words "chair lift" be removed.

Friendly Amendment

With the concurrence of the mover, Councillor Kett asked that the words "subject to the final decisions of the Budget" be added to the last paragraph and that the word "business" in the last paragraph be changed to "operating".

Friendly Amendment

Councillor Rivest requested that the following friendly amendment be considered:

THAT the motion be amended by deleting the last paragraph.

Motion to Amend

Councillor Gasparini, as the mover, did not agree with the foregoing amendment. Councillor Rivest then moved a motion to amend.

2004-10 Rivest-Caldarelli: THAT the motion be amended by deleting the last paragraph.

DEFEATED

Motion to Amend

Councillor Rivest then moved a motion to amend the foregoing motion.

2004-11 Rivest-Caldarelli: THAT the last paragraph be deleted and the following be substituted:

“AND FURTHER THAT funds maybe allocated if the need arises”.

DEFEATED

Motion to Amend

Councillor Reynolds then moved a motion to amend the foregoing motion.

2004-12 Reynolds-Rivest: THAT the motion be amended by deleting in full the last paragraph and that the following be substituted therefore:

“AND FURTHER THAT \$650,000 be committed to a reserve fund for Capital expenditures for recreational facilities through a reallocation of existing reserve funds and that these funds remain in reserve until such time as this Council directs.”

DEFEATED

Motion to Amend

Councillor Kett then moved a motion to amend the main motion.

2004-13 Kett-Gasparini: THAT the motion be amended by deleting the last paragraph and that the following be substituted:

“AND FURTHER THAT staff be directed to prepare a report on the establishment of a special Capital Reserve Fund for recreational facilities and that the report be presented following completion of the Leisure Master Plan.”

CARRIED

Friendly Amendment

With the concurrence of the mover, Councillor Craig asked that the words “for the Adanac Ski Hill, the Falconbridge Arena and the Dow Pool” be deleted from the motion.

Main Motion
(as amended)

2004-14 Gasparini-Berthiaume: WHEREAS many residents in the City of Greater Sudbury both throughout the election and during the budget consultation process have requested that Council consider the re-opening of recreational facilities that were closed in 2003;

AND WHEREAS these facilities contribute significantly to the overall quality of life in Greater Sudbury;

AND WHEREAS opportunities for active, physical recreation are essential to our overall health and well being given that we are

Item 13
Recreational Facilities
(continued)

facing a crisis of increased obesity amongst our population and have poor indicators of cardiac health;

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT the Council of the City of Greater Sudbury direct staff to prepare a report outlining options with alternative management and development models which will engage the community and involve interested citizens, including, for example, the possible creation of a not for profit corporation or the creation of a citizen management Board which could be mandated to market the facilities, increase utilization and fund raise in support of the facilities;

AND FURTHER THAT staff be directed to prepare a report on the establishment of a special Capital Reserve Fund for recreational facilities and that the report be presented following completion of the Leisure Master Plan.

RECORDED VOTE:

<u>YEAS</u>	<u>NAYS</u>
Berthiaume	Reynolds
Bradley	
Caldarelli	
Craig	
Dupuis	
Gainer	
Gasparini	
Kett	
Rivest	
Thompson	
Mayor Courtemanche	
Callaghan	

CARRIED

Item 14
Appointment of
Members of Council to
Ad Hoc Committee -
Internal Auditor

Presented by Councillor Caldarelli:

Caldarelli-Berthiaume: WHEREAS Members of Council, management and employees of the City of Greater Sudbury are all responsible to the taxpayer for the use of public resources;

AND WHEREAS local government auditors can contribute to identifying improvements in service delivery, cost savings and improved accountability;

AND WHEREAS citizens are requesting continued services with taxes being increased no more than is absolutely necessary;

Item 14
Appointment of
Members of Council to
Ad Hoc Committee -
Internal Auditor
(continued)

AND WHEREAS cost savings and additional revenue generated through the auditing process are value added benefits that cannot be ignored;

AND WHEREAS economy and efficiency audits and performance audits of local government can enhance municipal government accountability by independently reviewing and reporting on programs, functions, activities and organizations;

AND WHEREAS by conducting independent audits, auditors provide the public, elected officials and management with a fair, objective and reliable assessment of local government performance;

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT the Council of the City Greater Sudbury retain the services of an independent auditor who shall be responsible only to Council, for a one year trial period;

AND FURTHER THAT this Council appoint a the following Members of Council to an Ad Hoc Committee which will report back to Council by May 30th, 2004 with the recommended terms and conditions of such appointment:

Councillor Caldarelli
Councillor Kett
Councillor Reynolds

AND FURTHER THAT this Committee set out a time line to have the Council Auditor appointed and "in-place" prior to the start of the 2005 Budget process.

Recess

At 8:45 p.m., the Finance Committee recessed.

Reconvene

At 9:00 p.m., the Finance Committee reconvened.

Item 14
Appointment of
Members of Council to
Ad Hoc Committee -
Internal Auditor
(continued)

2004-15 Caldarelli-Berthiaume: WHEREAS Members of Council, management and employees of the City of Greater Sudbury are all responsible to the taxpayer for the use of public resources;

AND WHEREAS local government auditors can contribute to identifying improvements in service delivery, cost savings and improved accountability;

Main Motion

AND WHEREAS citizens are requesting continued services with taxes being increased no more than is absolutely necessary;

AND WHEREAS cost savings and additional revenue generated through the auditing process are value added benefits that cannot be ignored;

Item 14
Appointment of
Members of Council to
Ad Hoc Committee -
Internal Auditor
(continued)

AND WHEREAS economy and efficiency audits and performance audits of local government can enhance municipal government accountability by independently reviewing and reporting on programs, functions, activities and organizations;

AND WHEREAS by conducting independent audits, auditors provide the public, elected officials and management with a fair, objective and reliable assessment of local government performance;

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT the Council of the City Greater Sudbury retain the services of an independent auditor who shall be responsible only to Council, for a one year trial period;

AND FURTHER THAT this Council appoint a the following Members of Council to an Ad Hoc Committee which will report back to Council by May 30th, 2004 with the recommended terms and conditions of such appointment:

Councillor Caldarelli
Councillor Kett
Councillor Reynolds
Councillor Callaghan
Councillor Berthiaume
Councillor Rivest

AND FURTHER THAT this Committee set out a time line to have the Council Auditor appointed and "in-place" prior to the start of the 2005 Budget process.

CARRIED

Item 15
Freeze on Capital
Spending

Caldarelli-Berthiaume: WHEREAS Members of Council have been told very clearly by the taxpayers of this city that roads should be our number one priority this year;

AND WHEREAS any monies that may be forthcoming from the provincial and federal governments will likely not been seen by municipalities in this calendar year;

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT the Council of the City Greater Sudbury impose a freeze on all capital spending other than road projects until the end of 2004;

AND FURTHER THAT this Council continue to lobby the provincial and federal governments for monies to be used to rebuild our deteriorating infrastructure.

Motion for Deferral

It was moved by Councillor Reynolds that the foregoing motion be deferred to the Finance Committee in June pending a report on the impact of a capital freeze, and, that this report would not delay the 2004 Capital Budget.

The motion for deferral was carried on a show of hands.

Item 16
Materials & Operating Expenses

Caldarelli-Berthiaume: WHEREAS Members of Council, management and employees of the City of Greater Sudbury are all responsible to the taxpayer for the use of public resources;

AND WHEREAS tax increases have to be kept to the lowest possible level without sacrificing essential services;

AND WHEREAS to achieve this it is necessary to stop the dramatic increases which have been occurring in our operating budgets;

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT the Council of the City Greater Sudbury requests staff to bring in a budget for Materials and Operating expenses for 2004 which is no more than \$28,187,967, that being 5% more than the amount budgeted in 2003.

AND FURTHER THAT this reduction in the amount requested for the 2004 budget be made with no decrease in the number of full time employees and with as little disruption to citizen services as is possible.

Motion for Deferral

Councillor Rivest requested that the foregoing motion be deferred pending the conclusion of the Budget.

The motion for deferral was defeated on a show of hands vote.

2004-16 Caldarelli-Berthiaume: WHEREAS Members of Council, management and employees of the City of Greater Sudbury are all responsible to the taxpayer for the use of public resources;

AND WHEREAS tax increases have to be kept to the lowest possible level without sacrificing essential services;

AND WHEREAS to achieve this it is necessary to stop the dramatic increases which have been occurring in our operating budgets;

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT the Council of the City Greater Sudbury requests staff to bring in a budget for Materials and Operating expenses for 2004 which is no more than \$28,187,967, that being 5% more than the amount budgeted in 2003.

Item 16
Materials & Operating
Expenses
(continued)

AND FURTHER THAT this reduction in the amount requested for the 2004 budget be made with no decrease in the number of full time employees and with as little disruption to citizen services as is possible.

DEFEATED

Item 17
Budget Cost Centres

Caldarelli-Berthiaume: WHEREAS Members of Council, management and employees of the City of Greater Sudbury are all responsible to the taxpayer for the use of public resources;

AND WHEREAS it is incumbent upon all parties to practice fiscal responsibility and economic restraint;

AND WHEREAS keeping spending under control is essential for good fiscal management;

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT all employees be instructed that budget cost centers are not to be overspent without the express permission of Council;

AND FURTHER THAT before any cost center is overspent there must be a report to Council which explains all the reasons the expenditure must be made and why it cannot be delayed until the next fiscal year.

Motion to Amend

2004-17 Rivest-Kett: THAT the motion be amended by adding the following words after "overspent":

"10% or a maximum of \$50,000".

DEFEATED

Motion for Referral

It was moved by Councillor Caldarelli that the foregoing motion be referred to the Ad Hoc Committee - Council Auditor for further review.

The motion for referral was carried on a show of hands.

2004 PARKING LOT REVIEW - (SEE ATTACHED SCHEDULES A, B, C, D)

Item 19
Parking Lot Review

The Committee reviewed the Parking Lots for March 3, 8, 10 and 22, 2004 and the results of that review are shown on the attached schedules.

Rules of Procedure

The Committee concurred with a request by the Chair to deal with a motion not on the agenda.

Councillor Bradley - Enhancement Option

2004-17 Bradley-Berthiaume: THAT an option be prepared to setup a reserve of \$40,000 to repair and up keep all welcome signs for the outside past municipalities:

Rayside-Balfour
Walden
Valley East
Nickel Centre.

CARRIED

Adjournment

2004-18 Bradley-Caldarelli: That this meeting does now adjourn.
Time: 10:00 p.m.

CARRIED

Councillor Ted Callaghan, Chair

Council Secretary

2004 BUDGET PARKING LOT - SCHEDULE A

REQUEST #	COUNCILLOR	INFORMATION REQUEST (March 3, 2004)	APPROVED	
			YES	NO
1	Reynolds	Partner with community groups to create new synergies, cost-savings, and more productivity instead of competing with them i.e. Mayor's Roundtable for Seniors vs. Senior Friendly Sudbury GSDC vs. New Economy Sudbury	✓	
2	Rivest	Funds to establish an Advisory Committee on Capital Road Priorities; Capital Master Plan		✓

2004 BUDGET PARKING LOT - SCHEDULE B

REQUEST #	COUNCILLOR	INFORMATION REQUEST (MARCH 8, 2004)	APPROVED	
			YES	NO
1	Bradley	A report explaining when an accident becomes "lost time".	✓	

2004 BUDGET PARKING LOT - SCHEDULE D				
REQUEST #	COUNCILLOR	INFORMATION REQUEST (March 22, 2004)	APPROVED	
			YES	NO
1	Gasparini	prepare options for low income property owners	✓	
2	Craig	look into possible tax relief for low income apartment dwellers	✓	
3	Gasparini	a breakdown of the reduction in the number of employee (164) at the time of amalgamation into union and non-union	✓	
4	Berthiaume	a request for City of Greater Sudbury organizational charts with reporting relationships	✓	
5	Dupuis	information by employee group on service of employees	✓	
6	Rivest	an update on water/wastewater priority list	✓	
7	Berthiaume	budget options to eliminate snow clearing at Church and Community Service Groups parking lots	✓	
8	Callaghan	report on stabilized funding options for community non-profit shelters and to be included in the report, how other municipalities are managing their funding in this area	✓	
9	Callaghan	that staff report back to Council twice a year on all City tenders	✓	
10	Callaghan	staff report requested on the subject of consultant use within the Corporation, directed at identifying such areas as: costs related to consultants; mandated required use of consultants; ability to actually save monies by employing consultants to work with specialized areas; and further that this report be written with the intention of providing Council the ability for establishing future policy in the area of consultant use	✓	