

**CITY OF GREATER SUBBURY  
2005 - 2007 Winter Maintenance**

Cost Centre/ Function	2005 Actual Restated	2005 Budget Restated	2006 Projected Actual	2006 Budget Restated	2007 Approved Budget (June)	2007 Draft Budget	2007 Draft Budget (\$3M Reduction Option)
Sanding/Salting/Plowing	\$5,551,472	\$5,270,150	\$5,866,701	\$5,941,569	\$9,400,000	\$9,661,280	\$6,845,762
Winter Ditching	\$1,212,964	\$1,170,310	\$1,256,921	\$1,231,010	\$900,000	\$1,250,750	\$1,250,750
Snow Removal	\$321,080	\$820,550	\$3,319,077	\$1,359,630	\$850,000	\$895,925	\$895,925
Sidewalks	\$648,576	\$778,127	\$805,699	\$837,327	\$900,000	\$847,990	\$847,990
Misc Roads Misc	3 \$1,158,989	\$793,717	\$1,140,150	\$820,204	\$900,000	\$889,865	\$889,865
Training			\$0	\$0	\$350,000	\$0	\$0
Winter Supervision	\$813,403	\$743,710	\$933,020	\$560,992	\$1,100,000	\$1,277,692	\$1,077,514
<b>Subtotal</b>	<b>\$9,795,484</b>	<b>\$9,575,564</b>	<b>\$13,321,568</b>	<b>\$10,650,732</b>	<b>\$14,400,000</b>	<b>\$14,823,592</b>	<b>\$11,907,995</b>
Reallocations							
Roads Administration	5 \$420,245	\$443,575	\$77,227	\$611,494	\$611,494	\$528,000	\$528,000
Fringe Benefits	5 \$1,050,951	\$954,551	\$874,156	\$919,560	\$919,560	\$1,215,880	\$1,215,880
	<b>\$11,177,980</b>	<b>\$10,974,690</b>	<b>\$14,012,951</b>	<b>\$12,181,786</b>	<b>\$15,931,054</b>	<b>\$16,567,392</b>	<b>\$13,551,695</b>
<b>Increase</b>					<b>\$3,740,258</b>	<b>\$4,395,596</b>	<b>\$1,350,900</b>
<b>2007 LEVY IMPACT</b>					<b>2.40%</b>	<b>2.81%</b>	<b>0.89%</b>

**NOTES:**

1 City crews and owned equipment costs for Class 1-6 Salting/Sanding/Plowing	\$4,300,000	\$3,837,450	\$2,477,374
Contractor costs (including standby charges) for Class 4-6 Salting/Sanding/Plowing	\$3,700,000	\$4,127,240	\$2,671,798
Materials	\$1,400,000	\$1,696,500	\$1,696,500
	<b>\$9,400,000</b>	<b>\$9,661,280</b>	<b>\$6,845,762</b>

2 Sidewalks approved separately in June ( Option A)

3 Misc Roads Misc includes various road maintenance activities not associated with any major winter categories. Examples are road patrol, training, miscellaneous road maintenance done for others, as well as Winter Maintenance share of the Program Support allocation.

4 Training included in Roads Admin and Misc Roads ( app \$178,525)

5 Previous to 2007, the salaries and benefits of Roads Management and administrative staff were reflected in a separate section of the total Roads budget. To accurately capture all winter costs, approximately 50% was allocated to Winter and 50% to Summer for 2007 Budget. The 2006 budget was restated to enable a fair year over year comparison. A similar reallocation was done regarding fringe benefits paid on behalf of winter maintenance employees.

	Revised Option 1 From June, 2006	
	<p>Meet legislated hours of work;  3 Shifts of City employees on arterial and collector roads;  24 hour coverage Monday to Friday; 20 hour coverage on weekends with City crews;  At maximum 8 cm 29 part-time and 20 contractors mobilized on rural and residential roads;  1 shift of part-time City crews and contractors to service rural and residential roads; after 13 hours, only contractors continue on rural and residential roads extending service delivery time;  City crews supplement part-time and contractors on rural and residential.</p> <p>Tried to implement this model last winter and were <b>unsuccessful</b>.</p> <p>NOT RECOMMENDED</p>	
	<b>Original Option 1</b>	<b>Original Option 1 restated in today's dollars</b>
Class 1 - 3 Sanding/Salting/Plowing	4,300,000	4,400,000
Class 4 - 6 Sanding/Salting/Plowing	2,300,000	2,600,000
Winter Ditch/Spring Cleanup	900,000	900,000
Snow Removal	850,000	850,000
Winter Misc. Roads Maintenance	900,000	900,000
Supervision	1,100,000	1,300,000
Training	350,000	400,000
Materials Sand/Salt	1,400,000	1,700,000
<b>Sub-Total - Service Delivery</b>	<b>12,100,000</b>	<b>13,050,000</b>
Sidewalk Plow/Sand	850,000	900,000
Roads Administration	600,000	500,000
Fringe Benefits	900,000	1,200,000
<b>Total Winter Program including re-allocation from other Roads cost centres</b>	<b>14,500,000</b>	<b>15,650,000</b>

Winter Control Model Presented to Council, Monday, February 26, 2007

	<b>Current Budget Model -- Three shifts on Class 1 - 3 &amp; All Contractors on Class 4 - 6</b>	<b>Impact on Levy (based on 1.56M = 1%)</b>
Class 1 - 3 Sanding/Salting/Plowing	3,837,450	
Class 4 - 6 Sanding/Salting/Plowing	4,127,240	
Winter Ditch/Spring Cleanup	1,250,750	
Snow Removal	895,925	
Winter Misc. Roads Maintenance	889,865	
Supervision	1,277,692	
Materials Sand/Salt	1,696,590	
<b>Sub-Total - Service Delivery</b>	<b>13,975,512</b>	
Sidewalk Plow/Sand	847,990	
Roads Administration	528,000	
Fringe Benefits	1,215,880	
<b>Total Winter Program including re-allocation from other Roads cost centres</b>	<b>16,567,382</b>	
<b>Increase on the Levy before Reductions</b>		<b>2.81</b>

# Winter Program Operations

## Current Operations

- All Roads
- Mon. – Fri. – 3 shifts 24 hours/day
- Sat. – Sun. – overtime
- 24/7 contractors supplement

## If All Options<sup>1</sup> – 5 Accepted

- All Roads
- Mon. – Fri. – 16 hours/day;  
8 hours/day overtime
- Sat. – Sun. – overtime
- 24/7 contractors supplement

# Winter Program Service Levels

## Current Service Levels

- Arterial/Collectors
- As soon as storm starts
- Plow 5 cm
- Response 3 – 8 hours
- Bare pavement after storm – 8 hours
  
- Rural & Residential
- Plow  $\geq$  8 cm
- Response 8 – 12 hours
- Sanding after storm 8 – 12 hours

## Options<sup>1 – 5\*</sup> Accepted Service Levels

- Arterial/Collectors
- As soon as storm starts
- Plow 5 cm
- Response 3 – 8 hours
- Bare pavement after storm – 8 hours
  
- Rural & Residential
- Plow  $\geq$  8 cm
- Mon. – Fri. response 16 – 24 hours
- Sat. – Sun. – maximum 48 hours\*
- Sanding after storm 16 – 24 hours

# Worst Case Scenario

- 48 hour response in residential areas will ONLY occur IF:
  - Option 1 is chosen, resulting in a 50% loss of contracted service providers, **AND**
  - All overtime utilized, **AND**
  - No pool of unionized staff available

<b>Total Winter Program including re-allocation from other Roads cost centres</b>	<b>16,567,382</b>	
<b>Increase on the Levy before Reductions</b>		<b>2.81</b>
<b>Part 1</b> - Reduced contract services by 50% which would increase service time up to 24 hours on Class 4 - 6 Note: If combined with Part 2, potential for delayed service to Class 4 - 6 roads on weekends.	(1,374,278)	(0.88)
<b>Part 2</b> - 2 shifts on Class 1 - 3 provides either 24 hour service Mon to Fri and limited weekend coverage or up to 13 hour coverage on Sat & Sun with City crews. If combined with Part 1, potential for reduced service to Class 4 - 6 roads on weekends, delayed up to 48 hours	(746,038)	(0.48)
<b>Part 3</b> - Bare pavement to snow packed. City staff will analyse and recommend roads that could be converted from Class 1 - 3 to Class 4 - 6 service levels. Example of these roads are Gemmell, Hawthorne, Irving, Morris, Ninth, Tenth, Queen, George, Niemi Rd, Albany, Kelsey, Bruce, Elmview, Dominion Dr, Notre Dame & Marier	(614,038)	(0.39)
<b>Part 4</b> - Reduced staff positions by 1 foreperson at each of the 5 depots.	(200,178)	(0.13)
<b>Part 5</b> - Reduce standby season on winter control contracts from April 30 to April 15 which means contractors may not be available after April 15th.	(81,164)	(0.05)
<b>Total Reduction Options</b>	<b>(3,015,696)</b>	<b>(1.93)</b>
<b>Total Winter Program with all reduction options</b>	<b>13,551,686</b>	
<b>Increase on the Levy with all reduction options</b>	<b>1,369,900</b>	<b>0.88</b>
Customer Service Enhancement	200,000	0.13
<b>Total Winter Program with all reductions and enhancements</b>	<b>13,751,686</b>	<b>1.01</b>