

Request for Decision

Municipal Heritage Committee recommendation for the Former Ash Street Elevated Water Tank

Presented To:	Planning Committee
Presented:	Tuesday, Feb 16, 2010
Report Date	Wednesday, Feb 03, 2010
Type:	Managers' Reports

Recommendation

It is recommended that City Staff be authorized to:

1. include the 332 Pine Street elevated water tank in the City's register of heritage properties as a listed structure;
2. proceed with the demolition of the 332 Pine Street elevated water tank;
3. document the 332 Pine Street elevated water tank, prior to its demolition, and submit this information to the City of Greater Sudbury Archives for future reference and use; and,
4. investigate and report back on a process, including funding, to erect a historical plaque on the site, convert the site into a public park with a new public art element, which may incorporate parts of the existing elevated water tank.

Background:

On July 9, 2008 City Council agreed to postpone the planned demolition of the elevated water tank located at 332 Pine Street (the "tank") to provide the Municipal Heritage Committee with an opportunity to evaluate its cultural heritage value or interest of the structure, through resolution #2008-284, which read:

"WHEREAS City Council recently appointed a Municipal Heritage Advisory Panel to advise on heritage matters;

WHEREAS the Municipal Heritage Advisory Panel plans to prepare a city-wide inventory of buildings and structures that are of cultural heritage value or interest for Council's future consideration;

WHEREAS the former elevated water tank near Ash and Pine Streets in the former City of Sudbury has been declared surplus to the City's needs and is planned to be demolished;

WHEREAS the Municipal Heritage Advisory Panel has recommended that this elevated water tank be evaluated to determine whether it is of cultural heritage value or interest;

Signed By

Report Prepared By

Jason Ferrigan
Planner

Digitally Signed Feb 3, 10

Reviewed By

Mark Simeoni
Acting Manager of Community and
Strategic Planning

Digitally Signed Feb 3, 10

Recommended by the Division

Paul Baskcomb
Acting Director of Planning Services

Digitally Signed Feb 3, 10

Reviewed By

Bill Lautenbach
General Manager of Growth and
Development

Digitally Signed Feb 3, 10

Recommended by the Department

Bill Lautenbach
General Manager of Growth and
Development

Digitally Signed Feb 3, 10

Recommended by the C.A.O.

Doug Nadorozny
Chief Administrative Officer

Digitally Signed Feb 3, 10

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that City Staff postpone any further action with respect to the demolition of this former elevated water tank so that the Municipal Heritage Advisory Panel can undertake an evaluation to determine whether it has cultural heritage value or interest, in accordance with the criteria set out in the Ontario Heritage Act, and report back to Council on the same, together with recommendations for the future of this structure.”

Purpose:

This report presents the Municipal Heritage Committee’s conclusions regarding the cultural heritage value of the tank, and its recommendations for the future use of the site.

Discussion:

The tank is located on the north side of Pine Street, just west of Beatty Avenue in the community of Sudbury. The tank is approximately 40 metres tall and can hold approximately 2.3 million litres of water. The tank was constructed in 1946 and became operational in 1948.

It served as part of the City’s water supply system for fifty years. In 1998, the Ellis Reservoir was opened, and the tank was decommissioned and disconnected from the surrounding water supply system.

The Municipal Heritage examined the cultural heritage value of the site using the nine criteria set out in the Ontario Heritage Act. This evaluation involved several site visits, historical and archival research, consultation with Engineering Staff and a survey of seven other Ontario municipalities with similar elevated water tanks. The Municipal Heritage Committee’s Heritage Report on the tank is included in Appendix A.

At its November 19, 2009 Meeting, the Municipal Heritage Committee passed the following recommendation:

“THAT, based on the criteria set out in the Heritage Act, the water tower at 332 Pine Street has moderate to low cultural heritage value, and

THAT, it is the recommendation of the Subcommittee that the property be included in the City’s register of heritage properties as a listed building, and

THAT, if the tank is removed, at a minimum the property be documented and recorded and that a historical plaque be erected on the site. The site could also become a park where portions of the existing structure could be retained and be used as a public art element in this new park, and

THAT this new Public Art element should be selected through a Public Art competition; and

THAT staff report back with a recommendation for a process and funding for the same.”

Conclusion:

The Municipal Heritage Committee has found that the tank has low to moderate cultural heritage value and recommends that the tank be “listed” in the City’s register of heritage properties. The listing of the tank would not prevent its demolition. The Committee is also suggesting that a series of actions be taken, should City Council elect to proceed with the planned demolition of the tank.

Recommendation:

Based on the above, it is recommended that City Staff:

1. include the 332 Pine Street elevated water tank in the City's register of heritage properties as a listed structure;
2. proceed with the demolition of the 332 Pine Street elevated water tank;
3. document the 332 Pine Street elevated water tank, prior to its demolition, and submit this information to the City of Greater Sudbury Archives for future reference and use;
4. investigate and report back on a process, including funding, to erect a historical plaque on the site, convert the site into a public park with a new public art element, which may incorporate parts of the existing elevated water tank.